

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

Series of Questions Addressed to Eminent Scholar Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah,
Ameer of Hizb ut Tahrir through his Facebook Page (Fiqhi)

Answer to Question

Hadiths of “The Khilafah On the Method of Prophethood”

To: Mamoon Soofi

(Translated)

Question:

Asalaamu Alaiykum Warahmatullahi Wabarakatuhu. Dear Shaykh Ata ibn Khalil Abu Rashta.

I pray that all is well with you, your family and the Shabaab in the blessed Land of Palestine.

I pray that Allah (swt) honors us in reestablishing the Khilafah on the Methodology of our Beloved Prophet Muhammad (saw).

My name is Mamoon Soofi and I am from the Shabaab of Canada.

I wanted to ask regarding the authenticity of the Hadith in MUSNAD AHMED (no. 18596) about "The Khilafah on the method of the Prophethood"

All of my discussions thus far have resulted in just mentioning this Hadith and nothing further. Until recently, I was requested to look into the authenticity of the Hadith itself. It is important to note here that Arabic is not my first language so I am limited to what I can find and research.

As such I have come across a document that claims the following:

This hadith we use in particular from the MUSNAD AHMED (no. 18596) is one of the many versions where it says “Then there will be the Caliphate upon the way of the Prophethood...”. This final part is narrated by only one person (Ibrahim al-Wasiṭi) whose narrations are matruk (“abandoned”) meaning they are so unreliable as to be unworthy of being cited.

Here is the pdf document in Arabic that explains this: https://hawramani.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/12/idlibi_hadith_five_ages_islamic_state_prophethood.pdf

I would greatly appreciate it if you could clarify the matter for me so that I may be able to make sense of this cross-roads I am at.

Barak'Allahu Feekum ya Shaykh Ata!

May Allah (swt) continue to help us strive down the path of the Sirat-al-Mustaqeem

Ameen Ameen Ameen!!

Mamoon Soofi

Answer:

Assalam Alaikum Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatu

1- You mentioned in your question:

(This hadith we use in particular from the MUSNAD AHMAD (no. 18596) is one of the many versions where it says “Then there will be the Caliphate upon the way of the Prophethood...”)

However in Musnad Ahmad there is no Hadith regarding the Khilafah on the method of Prophethood under the number (18596)! Rather this Hadith is regarding other matters that

are not related to the Khilafah on the method of Prophethood, and the title of the Hadith is under the chapter of (Hadith of Abdullah Ibn Abi Awfa (ra))

2- As for the hadiths of the Khilafah on the method of prophethood, they are mentioned in many sources:

A- In Musnad Ahmad: 17680- (Sulaiman bin Dawood At-Tayaalisi told us, Dawood bin Ibrahim Al-Wasiti told me, Habib bin Salim an-Nu'man bin Bashir said: We were sitting in the mosque with the Messenger of Allah (saw) and Bashir, did not narrate much Hadiths from the Prophet (saw), Abu Tha'labah Al-Khushani said: O Bashir bin Saad do you memorise the Hadith of the Messenger of Allah (saw) about the rulers? Hudhaifah said: I memorized his sermon. Abu Tha'labah sat. Hudhaifah said: The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: **«تَكُونُ النَّبِيُّهُ فِيكُمْ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ تَكُونَ ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا إِذَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ يَرْفَعَهَا إِذَا شَاءَ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ يَرْفَعَهَا إِذَا شَاءَ أَنْ يَكُونَ ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا إِذَا شَاءَ أَنْ يَرْفَعَهَا ثُمَّ تَكُونُ مُلْكًا جَبْرِيَّةً فَتَكُونُ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ تَكُونَ ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا إِذَا شَاءَ أَنْ يَرْفَعَهَا ثُمَّ تَكُونُ خِلَافَةً عَلَىٰ مِنْهَاجِ النَّبِيِّهِ»** **“Prophethood will last with you as long as Allah wants it to last. Then there will be Khilafah according to the method of Prophethood, and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be hereditary rule (ملكًا عاصيًا), and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be an oppressive rule (ملكًا جبريَّة), and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be a Khilafah on the method of Prophethood.”** Then he (saw) fell silent”.

B- In Dala'il al-Nubuwwa by Al-Bayhaqi 2843 - (Abu Bakr Muhammad bin Al-Hasan bin Fork, may Allah have mercy on him, told us Abdullah ibn Jaafar Al-Asbahani told us, Yunus bin Habib told us, Abu Dawood At-Tayaalisi told us, Dawood Al-Wasiti said: He was trustworthy, he said: I heard Habib bin Salim, he said: I heard An-Nu'man bin Bashir bin Saad, in a Hadith mentioned by him, he said: Abu Tha'labah came and said: O Bashir bin Saad, do you memorize the Hadith of the Messenger of Allah (saw), about the rulers? Hudhaifah was sitting with Bashir, so Hudhaifah said: I memorized his sermon, so Abu Tha'labah sat and Hudhaifah said: The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: **«إِنَّكُمْ فِي النَّبِيِّهِ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ تَكُونَ، ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا إِذَا شَاءَ، ثُمَّ يَكُونُ خِلَافَةً عَلَىٰ مِنْهَاجِ النَّبِيِّهِ تَكُونُ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ تَكُونَ، ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا إِذَا شَاءَ، ثُمَّ تَكُونُ جَبْرِيَّةً تَكُونُ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ تَكُونَ، ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا، إِذَا شَاءَ أَنْ يَرْفَعَهَا، ثُمَّ تَكُونُ خِلَافَةً عَلَىٰ مِنْهَاجِ النَّبِيِّهِ»** **“You are in the Prophethood as long as Allah wants it to last. Then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be Khilafah according to the method of Prophethood, and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be an oppressive rule (ملكًا جبريَّة), and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be a Khilafah on the method of Prophethood.”**

C- In Musnad At-Tayaalisi 433- (Abu Dawood told us, he said: Dawood Al-Wasiti told us, and he was trustworthy, he said: I heard Habib bin Salim, he said: I heard An-Nu'man bin Bashir bin Saad, he said: We were sitting in the mosque with the Messenger of Allah (saw), and Bashir was a man who **did not narrate much Hadiths from the Prophet (saw)**, so Abu Tha'labah came, he said: O Bashir bin Saad, do you memorize the Hadith of the Messenger of Allah (saw) about the rulers? Hudhaifah was sitting with Bashir, so Hudhaifah said: I memorized his sermon. Tha'labah sat and Hudhaifah said: the Messenger (saw) said: **«إِنَّكُمْ فِي النَّبِيِّهِ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ تَكُونَ، ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا إِذَا شَاءَ، ثُمَّ تَكُونُ خِلَافَةً عَلَىٰ مِنْهَاجِ النَّبِيِّهِ، فَتَكُونُ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ تَكُونَ، ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا إِذَا شَاءَ، ثُمَّ تَكُونُ مُلْكًا عَاصِيًا، فَيَكُونُ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ يَكُونَ، ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا إِذَا شَاءَ أَنْ يَرْفَعَهَا، ثُمَّ تَكُونُ جَبْرِيَّةً، فَتَكُونُ مَا شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَنْ تَكُونَ، ثُمَّ يَرْفَعُهَا إِذَا شَاءَ أَنْ يَرْفَعَهَا، ثُمَّ تَكُونُ خِلَافَةً عَلَىٰ مِنْهَاجِ النَّبِيِّهِ»** **“Prophethood will last with you as long as Allah wants it to last. Then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be Khilafah according to the method of Prophethood, and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be hereditary rule (ملكًا عاصيًا), and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be an oppressive rule (ملكًا جبريَّة), and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be a Khilafah on the method of Prophethood.”**

D- In “Ithaf Al-Khaira Al-Mahra” - authored by Shihab Al-Din Ahmad bin Abi Bakr bin Ismail Al-Busairi (died: 840 AH):

[4164/1] Abu Dawood At-Tayaalisi said: Dawood Al-Wasiti - and he was trustworthy - narrated to us: I heard Habib bin Salim, I heard An-Nu'man bin Bashir bin Saad said: "We were sitting in the mosque (the mosque of the Messenger of Allah (saw)) and Bashir was a man who did not narrate much Hadiths from the Prophet (saw), so Abu Tha'laba came. He said: O Bashir bin Saad, do you memorize the Hadith of his Messenger (saw), about the rulers? Hudhaifah was present with Bashir, so Hudhaifah said: I memorized his sermon. Abu Tha'laba sat and Hudhaifah said; the Messenger (saw) said: «تكون فيكم النبوة ما شاء الله أن تكون، ثم يرفعها إذا شاء أن يرفعها، ثم تكون خلافة على منهاج النبوة، ثم تكون ما شاء الله أن تكون، ثم يرفعها إذا شاء أن يرفعها، ثم تكون ملكاً جبرية فتكون ما شاء الله أن تكون، ثم يرفعها إذا شاء أن يرفعها، ثم تكون خلافة على منهاج نبوة» ثم سكت. "Prophethood will last with you as long as Allah wants it to last. Then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be Khilafah according to the method of Prophethood, and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be hereditary rule (ملكاً عاصياً), and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be an oppressive rule (ملكاً جبرية), and it will last for as long as Allah wishes, then He will lift it if He wishes. Then there will be a Khilafah on the method of Prophethood." Then he (saw) fell silent".

3- It is clear from these Hadiths **that Dawood bin Ibrahim Al-Wasiti is trustworthy. He is mentioned by Ahmad in his Musnad, and by Al-Bayhaqi in "Dala'il al-Nubuwwah", and by Al-Tayaalisi in his Musnad, and Al-Busairi in "Ithaf Al-Khaira Al-Mahra". This is sufficient to prove the authenticity of the Hadith. In addition, Ibn Hibban documented him as one of the trustworthy mentioned in his book "Ath-Thiqat"** by Imam Al-Hafidh Abi Hatim Muhammad bin Hibban bin Ahmad Al-Tamimi Al-Basti, who died in the year 354 AH - 965 CE.

4- But Salah Al-Din Al-Idlibi on his website, through the link that you sent, searches for Dawood ibn Ibrahim and says he is Al-Wasiti or Al-Aqili, then talks about Dawood bin Ibrahim Al-Aqili and mentions narrations as Matrook "abandoned" and says: (Dawood bin Ibrahim the judge of Qazvin is Al-Aqili) and adds (Al-Azdi said he is unknown, liar). He adds (It may be said that Dawood bin Ibrahim Al-Wasiti was trusted by the narrator, Abu Dawood Al-Tayaalisi, the author of the Musnad, so is it acceptable that he is trusted by the one who narrates from him!) As if Al-Idlibi does not accept his authentication! And he is not accepted as trustworthy by Ibn Hibban!

And he adds: (If Dawood bin Ibrahim Al-Wasiti was in the chain of narrators is accused of lying, then the chain of transmission is corrupt, and if there is other than him present, then the chain of transmission is fine, and if doubt occurs, the least duty is to stop.)!

Why is there any doubt? It was reported from him in Al-Bayhaqi in "Dala'il al-Nubuwwah", and by Al-Tayaalisi in his Musnad, and by Al-Busairi in "Ithaf Al-Khaira al-Mahra", **and he was mentioned in their chain of narrators that he is trustworthy and they extracted the Hadith, and Ahmad also included it in his Musnad, and Ibn Hibban mentioned him as trustworthy...** So how can a doubt occur?!

In Conclusion: The Hadith of the "Khilafah on the method of Prophethood" was narrated by the major Hadith scholars (Muhadiths) and its chain of transmission is correct.

Your Brother,

Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah

15 Muharram Al-Haram 1443 AH

23/8/2021CE

The link to the answer from the Ameer's Facebook page:

<https://web.facebook.com/HT.AtaabuAlrashtah/posts/3002688499977154>