

Series of Questions Addressed to Eminent Scholar Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah,
Ameer of Hizb ut Tahrir through his Facebook Fiqhi Page

Answer to Question

**Does the Rejection of the Meaning (Dirayah) of the Hadith
Affects the Narration (Riwayah) of the Hadith?**

To: Nizar Steitieh

(Translated)

Question:

Assalam Alaikum Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatuh

May Allah (swt) grant you victory and steadfastness in carrying the Banner.

Does the Rejection of the Meaning (Dirayah) of the Hadith Affects the Narration (Riwayah) of the Hadith?

In other words, if it is proven that a particular Hadith is rejected in meaning, does that lead to defamation in one of its narrators, whether it was the last narrator who conveyed the Hadith (khabar) or the first who communicated what he witnessed or heard?

Jazak Allah Khair

Answer:

Acceptance of the Khabar Ahad is only taken after fulfilling the conditions for its authenticity in terms of narration (riwayah) and meaning (dirayah).

1- As for completing the conditions of the narration (riwayah), it is when the chain of transmission of the Hadith is authentic, i.e. the Hadith from its beginning to its end. The conditions of authenticity apply on its men, i.e. the narrator of the Hadith must be a Muslim, mature, sane, just, truthful, controlling what he hears, memorizing it from time he carried it to the time of relating it...etc., and this is what makes the Hadith authentic as a narration (riwayah).

2- As for completing the conditions for its authenticity in terms of meaning (dirayah), that is so, as long as the text of the Hadith does not contradict what is stronger than it from a verse or a Mutawatir or Mashhoor Hadith.

This means that if one of the narrators is weak or is ignorant in the chain of transmitters (sanad)...etc., then its narration (riwayah) is rejected.

But if there is no contention regarding the men of the chain of narration, but only its text contradicts what is stronger than it, then it is rejected in meaning (dirayah)

Therefore, the rejection of the meaning does not indicate that one of the narrators is weak or defamed...etc. If something similar was present in one of the chains of narrators, the Hadith would have been rejected as a narration. The rejection of the meaning means that the men of the chain of narration have nothing to contend about, but the text (matn) contradicts that which is stronger than it.

It is stated in the book, *The Islamic Personality* Volume 1, (English edition p. 153 / Arabic edition p.188):

(The issue is that if a Hadith contradicts what was mentioned in the Qur'an, which is definite in meaning, then the Hadith is rejected, in meaning i.e., text (matn), because its meaning contradicts the Qur'an. This is like what was narrated on the authority of Fatimah bint Qais who said: «طَلَّقْتِي زَوْجِي ثَلَاثًا عَلَى عَهْدِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ فَأَتَيْتُ النَّبِيَّ ﷺ فَلَمْ يَجْعَلْ لِي سَكَنًا وَلَا نَفَقَةً» **“My husband divorced me thrice during the time of the Messenger of Allah (saw), so I went to the Prophet (saw) and he did not give me a residence or a provision”** This Hadith is rejected because it contradicts the Qur'an, as it contradicts the Allah's (swt) saying: ﴿أَسْكِنُوهُمْ مِّنْ حَيْثُ سَكَنْتُمْ مِّنْ وَّجْدِكُمْ﴾ [At-Talaq: 6]

In this instance, the Hadith is rejected because it contradicted the Qur'an's definite text and definite meaning. But if the Hadith does not contradict the Qur'an by including things that the Qur'an did not mention, or in addition to what is in the Qur'an, then the Hadith is taken into consideration and the Qur'an is taken into consideration. And it is not said that we are sufficed with the Qur'an and what is mentioned in the Qur'an because Allah (swt) commanded following both of them and belief is obligatory in both of them.

It was stated in the book, *The Islamic Personality* Volume 3, (Arabic p. 90-91):

(Conditions for accepting Khabar Al-Ahad: Khabar Al-Ahad is accepted if it fulfills its conditions in terms of narration and meaning. As for the conditions for accepting the narration, the narrator of the Hadith must be a Muslim, mature, sane, just, truthful, controlling what he hears, memorizing it from the time of carrying it to the time of relating it. The scholars of Usul and the scholars of the science of Hadith have explained the conditions of the narration in details, and they explained the history of the men of Hadith and its narrators, each narrator, and if they have the qualities mentioned above in details. As for the conditions for accepting Khabar Al-Ahad in terms of meaning, it must not contradict what is stronger than it, in terms of verses or a Mutawaatir or Mashoor Hadith, such as what was narrated on the authority of Fatimah bint Qais that she said: «طَلَّقْتِي زَوْجِي ثَلَاثًا فَلَمْ يَجْعَلْ لِي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ سَكَنًا وَلَا نَفَقَةً» **“My husband divorced me thrice during the time of the Messenger of Allah, (saw) so I went to the Prophet (saw) and he did not give me a residence or a provision”** [Extracted by Muslim]. This Hadith contradicts the saying of the Allah (swt): ﴿أَسْكِنُوهُمْ مِّنْ حَيْثُ سَكَنْتُمْ مِّنْ وَّجْدِكُمْ﴾ [At-Talaq: 6].

Therefore, it must be rejected, and it is not permissible to act upon it...)

I hope that this is sufficient and Allah Knows Best, He is Most Wise.

Your Brother,

Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah

30 Shawwal 1443 AH

30/5/2022 CE

The link to the answer from the Ameer's Facebook page:

<https://www.facebook.com/HT.AtaabuAlrashtah/posts/566686988352008>